

**SALT LAKE CITY
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
In Room 326 of the City & County Building
451 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah
Wednesday, May 9, 2007**

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were Chairperson Peggy McDonough and Vice Chairperson Matthew Wirthlin; Commissioners Frank Algarin, Babs De Lay, Robert Forbis, Susie McHugh, Kathy Scott and Mary Woodhead.

Present from the Planning Division were George Shaw, Planning Director, Cheri Coffey, Deputy Planning Director, Doug Wheelwright, Deputy Planning Director, Everett Joyce, Senior Planner, Ray McCandless, Senior Planner and Cecily Zuck, Senior Secretary.

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. Chairperson McDonough called the meeting to order at 5:46 p.m. Audio recordings of Planning Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

A field trip was held prior to the meeting. Planning Commissioners present were: Frank Algarin, Kathy Scott, Susie McHugh and Mathew Wirthlin. Planning Staff present were: Cheri Coffey, Doug Wheelwright, Everett Joyce and Ray McCandless.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES from Wednesday, April 25, 2007.

(This item was heard at 5:47 p.m.)

Commissioner De Lay made a motion to approve the minutes, Commissioner McHugh seconded the motion. Commissioners Algarin and Woodhead abstained. All others voted 'Aye'. The minutes were approved.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND THE VICE-CHAIR

(This item was heard at 5:48 p.m.)

Chairperson McDonough noted that she and Vice Chair Wirthlin had been invited to participate in a Foothill Hillside Slope Committee which is part of a City Council sponsored project, conducted by Bear West Consultants, to study Foothill issues in Salt Lake City.

Vice Chairperson Wirthlin stated that he had a list of discussion questions that they would be dealing with in the slope study. He noted that he would scan and email the list to all of the Commissioners so that the Commissioners could relay back any input that they may have for the Bear West Consultants.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

(This item was heard at 5:50 p.m.)

Downtown Master Plan Amendments

George Shaw noted that the City attorneys would be present at the May 23, 2007 Planning Commission meeting to discuss the Downtown Master Plan amendment, and what the process would be since the City Council had overturned the veto by Mayor Anderson regarding the City Creek sky bridge proposal. Mr. Shaw noted that Planning Staff hoped to have substantial representation from the Planning Commission at this meeting.

Planning Commission Training

Mr. Shaw noted that there was a flier before the Commission informing them of a series of upcoming seminars for Certified Community Planners, which Planning Staff would recommend the Commissioners attend. Mr. Shaw noted that there was one in North Salt Lake coming up at the end of May as well as one in December that might be more advantageous, noting that the seminars fill up very quickly.

DISCUSSION

(This item was heard at 5:51 p.m.)

The Commission discussed the draft Visioning Principles of the Northwest Quadrant Master Plan.

Chairperson McDonough recognized Everett Joyce as Staff representative for this item.

Mr. Joyce reviewed some slides outlining the area of the City identified as the Northwest Quadrant. He then noted that the Commission had received, in the form of this visionary document, the result of information compiled from several meetings with the technical and advisory committees for the Northwest Quadrant Master Plan; stakeholders, environmental experts, the public, and the collection of data from City agencies, including the adopted policies of Master Plans and existing environmental factors. Mr. Joyce stated that this conceptual document was being developed near the culmination of Phases One and Two of the Northwest Quadrant Master Plan development process. He then stated that at this point, the Commission's role was to review the document before them, identify any changes they felt necessary, and forward their recommendation to the City Council.

Commissioner De Lay noted that there was an enormous amount of community support at the open house meeting which had been held at the Salt Lake Public Library, and that the document seemed to reflect the concerns of the community in an exemplary manner.

Commissioner Scott inquired of Mr. Joyce why there were no specific design considerations included for Public Services, which was currently a dominant feature within the Northwest Quadrant.

Mr. Joyce noted that this could be addressed in the future.

Chairperson McDonough noted that the Sustainability and Green Design Principles included in the Visioning Document were wonderful, and she wondered how they could be implemented into the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Joyce stated that the principles would be adopted as part of the final policies of the Northwest Quadrant Master Plan and that the next step would be to create alternative Land Use Plans, as well as to find ways to implement these changes within the Ordinance. Mr. Joyce noted that this process would include more discussions with community environmental leaders, the U.S. Corps of Engineers and the plan's consultants.

Commissioner Forbis inquired why the Visioning Principles did not include design considerations for the orientation of building towards natural resources, citing the example of the Jordan River Parkway, where nothing faces the Jordan River itself. Commissioner Forbis noted that he felt this principle would lend itself towards a sense of ownership of natural resources and responsibility, and should be a guiding environmental principle of such developments.

Mr. Joyce noted that this was an excellent point and stated that Staff would look into adding standards for such developments.

Commissioner Scott made a motion to forward a position recommendation to the City Council regarding the Northwest Quadrant Visioning Principles. Vice Chairperson Wirthlin seconded the motion. All voted 'Aye'. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairperson McDonough called for a five minute recess.

Planning Staff members Cheri Coffey and Everett Joyce were excused from the meeting at this time.

ISSUES ONLY HEARING

(This item was heard at 6:14 p.m.)

A request by Christopher F. Robinson for approval of the proposed Ensign Foreground Planned Development subdivision located at approximately 750 North DeSoto Street in a Foothills Protection (FP) Zoning District. The following petitions are being considered as part of this request:

1. **Petition 400-06-46**—a request to amend the Capitol Hill Master Plan future land use map for the subject property from Foothill Preservation Residential to Very Low Density Residential and Open Space, and to rezone the subject property proposed to be developed (approximately 5 acres) from a Foothills Protection (FP) zoning district to a Foothills Residential (FR-2) Zoning District and rezone approximately 38 acres from Foothills Protection (FP) to Open Space (OS) or Natural Open Space (NOS).
2. **Petition 400-07-08**—a request to close and declare as surplus property a portion of 700 North Street located generally between Columbus and Cortez Streets.
3. **Petition 410-06-39**—Planned Development approval of a proposed 6-lot single family residential subdivision with a private street.
4. **Petition 490-06-50**— Preliminary subdivision approval of a proposed 6-lot single-family residential planned development subdivision.

Chairperson McDonough recognized Ray McCandless as Staff representative.

Ray McCandless noted that the applicant had a Power Point presentation reviewing the proposed development. Mr. McCandless stated that this proposal was part of a request to take a parcel, slightly over forty-four acres in size, and divide it into two parcels, one to be thirty-nine acres in size, deeded to Salt Lake City and dedicated as Open Space or Natural Open Space, and a second parcel to be five acres in size to be subdivided into six developable lots.

Mr. McCandless stated that a petition within the overall request included the closure of a portion of 700 North which had been platted but never developed due to the slope of the topography. Mr. McCandless noted that there was a separate small parcel to the southeast of the subject property currently zoned R-2 that would be incorporated into the rezoning request and was to be rezoned FR-2 to match the surrounding zoning.

Doug Wheelwright noted that the request was a Foothill Subdivision and therefore required a two part process for approval. Mr. Wheelwright stated that the first of which would be the current issues only hearing. He noted that the second portion would be a public hearing to be held at a later unspecified date, with the Commission making a motion at that time to approve or deny the request for the subdivision, as well as make recommendations to the City Council regarding the applications for the street closure, rezoning and the Capitol Hill Master Plan Amendment.

Commissioner De Lay inquired if there was any plan on the part of Salt Lake City to develop any sort of trail system within the Natural Open Space to be dedicated to the City.

Mr. McCandless noted that right now, the two zoning possibilities being explored were Open Space or Natural Open Space, and the developer was currently looking at trail options for the property.

Mr. Wheelwright stated that there was currently a future plan to connect this property with a North Salt Lake trailhead.

Chairperson McDonough invited the applicant, Christopher Robinson, forward to speak to the Commission.

Mr. Robinson noted that the proposed Planned Development would be a six lot private subdivision. Mr. Robinson stated that this proposal was the last phase of development which had been ongoing since the 1950's and the development would include non-motorized public trails, while maintaining access to a fire-cessation access road on the north end of the property.

Mr. Robinson noted that the proposed closure of 700 North would be beneficial to the City as International Fire Safety Code prohibits road development on slopes with grades of more than ten percent and there is land on this parcel with slopes in excess of that. He stated that the proposed 700 North Street Closure would be between Columbus and Cortez Streets.

Mr. Robinson presented slides which indicated the existing and proposed grading of the subject property. He noted that the proposed re-zoning would call for approximately three to five acres to be rezoned FR-2. He also noted that field surveys had revealed that there was a great deal of fill and disturbed slope areas on the southwest corner of the property.

Mr. Robinson reviewed site plans of the proposed lots with buildable areas indicated, as well as several photos showing the end of DeSoto street, the slope on the east side of the parcel, disturbed terrain looking west over the parcel, the existing trail consisting of an old road to Davis County and several alternative views of the disturbed terrain on the subject property.

Mr. Robinson reviewed how the current subject parcel would be subdivided, noting that several lot line adjustments with adjoining neighbors may occur before the final platting.

Chairperson McDonough opened the floor to questions from the Commissioners.

Vice Chairperson Wirthlin inquired why the proposal was for a gated community.

Mr. Robinson noted that he would prefer a public street subdivision; however, if it became a public street subdivision, the biggest concern was that the public would use the street and Open Space for undesirable purposes. Mr. Robinson noted that there were already people who used the Open Space area, which was accessible by vehicles, as an ungoverned space for unlawful activities at night.

Chairperson McDonough inquired what the applicant's plan for trail use was.

Mr. Robinson reviewed possible trail configurations for the subject property, noting that they wished to provide suitable public access for the community for mountain biking and hiking opportunities, but wanted to limit vehicular access and existing abuse in the area. He noted that the Capitol Hill Community Council suggested a possible trail connection could be made with Edgcombe Road; however, there was a private property owner adjacent to the subject parcel reluctant to do this and the grade was very steep.

Chairperson McDonough noted her concern as well about the gated community and asked if Mr. Robinson's intention with the trails was to divert the public away from the private subdivision.

Mr. Robinson stated that it was not and that he intended to allow pedestrian and bicycle access around the gate.

Chairperson McDonough noted that the proposed grade change on the east side of the subject parcel was not all part of Mr. Robinson's property.

Mr. Robinson noted that topographical analysis had revealed the grading would be beneficial to all involved and the other parcel owners were in agreement.

Chairperson McDonough stated that she felt the grading would be truly a human intervention, seeming unnatural and too regular in the face of the obviously natural topography of the surrounding area.

Mr. Robinson said that he would agree with that and would look at alternative ways to bring a more natural look to the proposed grading on the east side of proposed lot number four.

Chairperson McDonough opened the floor to Community Council representatives and the public.

George Stutzenberger, Vice Chair of the Capitol Hill Community Council, was there to speak to the hearing item. Mr. Stutzenberger stated that the Council was mostly in favor of the proposal, especially regarding the gain of Open Space for the City, stating his recommendation that the parcel be zoned Natural Open Space to limit human intervention, especially since there were steep re-vegetation areas prone to landslides on the parcel which should not be disturbed.

He noted that several residents of the Capitol Hill Community had approached him regarding the trailhead at the end of DeSoto Street and voiced their concern that access to this trailhead should remain open to the public.

Mr. Stutzenberger stated that the grading concerned the Council and that it should be kept as minimal as possible. Mr. Stutzenberger stated that it would be beneficial to see some sort of speed barrier installed at the base of the street leading into the Planned Development. Mr. Stutzenberger noted that he would like to see that the No Parking signs at the end of the street remain as they were.

Dan Bethel, 707 North DeSoto Street, noted his concern that the end of DeSoto Street might look like a dam from his property if the grade change occurred as proposed. Mr. Bethel also stated that he wished for the trail to not be at the end of De Soto but stated that he understood the desire of the community to maintain public access to the Open Space parcel and had not had any problems from hikers accessing the trail from his street.

Commissioner McDonough closed the Public Hearing portion of the meeting and requested comments from the Commission.

Vice Chairperson Wirthlin noted that his preference would be to rezone the area as Natural Open Space and that he would like to see more of a plan from Staff at the Public Hearing regarding how this Natural Open Space might be used.

Commissioners Forbis, McHugh and Scott concurred with Vice Chair Wirthlin.

Chairperson McDonough noted that the Commission would like to see as much information as possible on a trail proposal and suggested that the applicant come back with more detailed recommendations.

Chairperson McDonough inquired of the Commission if there was any concern about the proposed lot sizes.

Commissioner Forbis stated that with the amount of surrounding Open Space, he felt the proposed lot sizes were in harmony, keeping with the natural feel of the surrounding area.

Doug Wheelwright stated that this request was the culmination of about a twenty year process; developing the Ensign Downs area. Mr. Wheelwright noted that the two things which made this proposal especially complicated were the disturbance of thirty percent steep slope areas which would require special and careful consideration, as well as the proposed massive re-grading of the subject property for the private subdivision parcels. Mr. Wheelwright noted that Staff would give a great deal of detail in the Staff Report regarding these issues.

Chairperson McDonough noted that she would like to see a larger encompassing picture of how the development would effect the surrounding area, particularly what type of ownership the property was surrounded by.

There were no further comments from the Commission or Staff.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

There was no unfinished business.

The meeting adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

Cecily Zuck, Senior Secretary